

Referee Report for the Paper
Systematic Fiscal Policy and Macroeconomic performance:
A critical overview of the literature
MS 1230

August 29, 2014

Summary

The manuscript “Systematic Fiscal Policy and Macroeconomic performance: A critical overview of the literature” aims to provide a systematic review of the large economic literature that analyzes the relationship between macroeconomic and fiscal variables. It intends to cover both the theoretical and empirical literature on the subject, with reference to the developed economies. As this is a literature review, there are not identified specific findings, but are highlighted what are the most important elements arising from the works analyzed.

In my opinion, the understanding of the role played by systematic fiscal policy on countries’ macroeconomic performance has certainly merits. The topic is very actual and relevant, and the papers enters in the debate in a timely manner, providing an useful guide, even for not necessarily expert readers, to understand how this research topic is addressed in the literature. For this reason the paper fits well in the category "Surveys and Overviews" of *Economics*.

Nonetheless, the paper presents some elements that require a review by the authors:

Major Comments

- *Structure of the paper.* The structure of the paper is not entirely clear. The key point of this paper is the ability to provide a rational structure of the literature on a subject so vast and complicated. However, the paper does not give a clear evidence of this structure and how the different sections are linked to each other. An explicit paragraph in the first section covering the structure of the paper would therefore be useful.
- *Coverage of the paper.* Several choices are made by the author with respect to what topics the paper covers or not. This is a necessary and fully understandable choice, given the vastness of the literature. However, the choices of the author are not adequately supported in the text, thus leaving room for criticisms on the adequate coverage of the literature review. More details that explain author’s vision in addressing the literature would then be useful.

Minor Comments

- *Definitions.* Since the beginning of the paper, the author uses the term “Systematic”. As, according to *Economics’* Aims and Scope, the Surveys and Overviews are directed to a general audience interested in economic issues, a clear clarification of the concept is needed.
- *Summary of the econometric results:* it would be useful to provide some tables summarizing the different results obtained in the cited econometric works. By specifying country coverage, time span, econometric technique, this would better clarify why some papers reach conflicting results.

Concluding Remarks

I personally suggest the publication of this paper, especially due to the policy relevance of the topic, in *Economics* E-Journal. Its aim is perfectly in line with the Surveys and Overviews publishing area. Nevertheless, before its publishing, it is important to strength it by giving a better structure of the contents. This would help the reader in the understanding of the topic and author’s critical view.