

I don't think this paper is quite ready to be submitted to a scholarly journal. It is unnecessarily hard to understand. I have started to read it carefully, and for the time being have given up in frustration. Here are some of the things I had problems understanding. I would like the authors to deal with these issues, explain things better, and enable me to read smoothly through the article. Thus, I am sending it back for a revise and resubmit. I will be happy to look at a more polished version. My expectation is that that version will be publishable. I did read through the whole paper enough to decide that I like their model, but I have not checked it line by line. The authors need to be kinder to the referee, by making their work super easy to understand.

Reader's comments on Jung-Hyun Yoon and Song Soo Lim, "Potential Distortion Effects of State Trading Enterprises: Tariff-Rate Quota Scheme"

In bibliography either put in Skully's middle initial in all references or in none.

In bibliography you want to be consistent in your use of commas.

Page 4. aT has not been defined.

Page 5. What is an import mark-up? Is this after the quota has already been exceeded?

In Table 1. How is HI determined? At first I presumed it is an average over some period of time. Now I presume that it is imports allocated according to what was imported in the past by some group. This needs to be specified. Is HI a subset of End-User? This needs clarification.

Is the release price a weighted average of the world price plus the 5 percent tariff on the within quota imports plus the much larger tariff on the amount exceeding the quota? If not, then why even discuss the two different tariffs?