

Report on “Cruise Tourism Externalities and Residents’ Support: A Generalized Ordered Logit Analysis,” by Brida, Del Chiappa, Meleddu, and Pulina

Using survey data, the authors seek to investigate the determinants of support for increased investment to facilitate cruise tourism in Messina, a port of call in Sicily, Italy. Using a generalized ordered logit model, the authors find that residents in favor of increased investment and tourism are those whose incomes depend on cruise activity, those with personal cruise experience, those with larger families and those with an expected increase in welfare. Those not viewing the expansion activities favorably tend to be female, retired, and those who view the environment as deteriorating. Cruise tourism in Italy is an important and timely topic.

I do have several suggestions for the authors that I believe will improve this paper. I also have a suggestion for future research. My suggestions follow in no particular order.

1. A table showing frequencies of response for the dependent variable would be useful.

ANSWER: As suggested, frequencies of response are provided for the dependent variable (Table 3) as well as for the externality variables (Table 1).

2. Given that the authors are estimating logit models, some presentation and discussion of marginal effects might be useful.

ANSWER: Following this recommendation, full results are provided in terms of both odds ratio and marginal effects.

3. If the data permit (see 1 above), I suggest estimating a simple logit model using data for those respondents in the highest and lowest response categories. This should maximize contrast. With this type of data I worry if the respondents can make a useful distinction between some of the intermediate categories. This will only be possible if there are sufficient responses in the “very high” and “very low” categories.

ANSWER: Following your advise, a logit model was run by using a dichotomous variable containing the highest and the lowest response category. However, the findings have turned out to be empirically worse, and based upon the tests of the parallel assumption (likelihood test and Brant test), a generalized ordered logit model was reported. Full results can be provided upon request.

4. I suggest that readability could be improved if the authors used more descriptive variable names in the text.

ANSWER: Please note that having completely restructured the empirical analysis, this suggestion does not apply anymore.

5. The paper could benefit from editing.

ANSWER: Please note that the authors will undertake a final proof-reading of the paper upon acceptance. You may appreciate this as a strategy to minimize research costs.

6. I also suggest that the present study may well overstate the case for expanded investment because Messina is and has been a port-of-call. It is quite possible that individuals may have “have voted with their feet,” in that those individuals who do not want to be around cruise

tourism and tourism activities may have already left the area. On the other hand, those attracted by the prospect of employment in the tourism industry and related areas may have moved to Messina. To the extent that any of this has taken place, the findings in the present study may reflect the previous movement of the population. I wonder if it is possible to obtain any information on the population change in Messina over time? One could perhaps determine whether the population movements have occurred.

ANSWER: Thanks for these very interesting comment. However, such a type of information are not available at present and, as a consequence, we can not address your suggestions. Anyway, we tried to address your suggestion in the concluding remarks (p. 18).

7. In the next study, I would suggest the authors use something like “willingness to pay” or “willingness to accept” in this framework. The survey instrument could easily be amended to do something like this.

ANSWER: Thank you also for this suggestion. In the near future, we would intend to further expand the present paper by considering the willingness to pay through a stated preferences exercise, such as a choice experiment. The present research will help us to better address the status quo and possible scenarios.

*Thank you.*