

Referee report on “A Note on Aoki-Yoshikawa Model” by Enrico Scalas and Ubaldo Garibaldi

The paper by Enrico Scalas and Ubaldo Garibaldi examines the A-Y model from dynamics perspectives. The main innovation respect the A-Y model is that the mobility of workers among the sectors c is variable (In A-Y is only $c = 0$). I think that the paper is generally clear, well written and well motivated. Anyway the paper in same part I think it is difficult for not physics background people.

Is the contribution of the paper potentially significant?

The generalization of the AY model using Markovian dynamics is significant, innovative and useful contribution. Nice the analogy between energy level and productivity. Anyway there strong and limited assumption (some of Aoki-Yoshikawa and some of Scalas and Garibaldi), for instance: the production depend only a one factor: labour (=population), why the productivity (formula 3) cannot be equal?, the binary move, the total amount of workers is constant n .

Is the analysis correct?

The method of analysis is consolidate in literature and the authors are expert in the topic. In some part of the paper the exposition is more oriented a physicist than economist.

1 Minor issues

Finally, some minor issues.

1. A more specific title.
2. Different Keywords.
3. page 2: Why define Y , D , GDP if everything is the same.
4. Use different letter C of formula (10) and c of formula (22).