

Review: Bilol Buzurukov and Byeong Wan Lee „The Impact of Corruption on Apprehension Level of Aliens: A Study of the United States Immigration ”

I find the main idea of the paper very interesting and personally I like it a lot. Nevertheless, there is still a lot of work in front of Authors to make it publishable.

This paper is an example of “mechanical” approach to modeling in economics. Procedures and tests are applied here without an attempt to understand mechanisms behind analyzed phenomena. I find apprehension ← all crimes ← corruption link missing. Corruption seems to be very specific type of crime.

Additionally the article looks more like metrics class project than scientific article. The article is way too long and there is a lot of unnecessary content. Instead of showing all the calculated models it would be enough to show 2-3 best ones. It would also benefit from reducing amount of fairy tales in the introduction. It will be also easier to read if the language was more formal rather than poetic (cancer comparisons etc. are unnecessary). Section 2 Opinions and Facts seems to be loose bunch of concepts with no clear line of reasoning. Does not seem necessary for understanding research done by authors. Or at least I could not see it. Also Appendixes 2-5 not really needed in this paper. And explaining every single test used (like Jarque-Bera test with rejection rules). I assume most of the readers of this journal have basic econometric books or at least access to Wikipedia.

Positive education coefficient- explanation not very convincing. I'm also not convinced by using logarithms to all variables.

Although policy implications seems legit, conclusion 'El Salvador (CI=65) reduces the corruption level to that of Saudi Arabia (CI=55), the average number of apprehended Salvadorians in the United States could be reduced to about 89 people.' might be slightly too strong. Interpreting exact numbers might be misleading. Additionally this conclusion assumes causality, but what is shown by models within the paper is just inference.

Technical detail: sections should be numbered either Greek or Arabic. Besides as far as I know, multiplying by 100 does not give log but %. Also amount of explanations could be reduced in that paragraph.

To conclude, the idea is interesting but the manuscript I have received is not ready to publish yet. Therefore I'd encourage the Authors to improve it.