Comments on submission Economics-751-1:

The paper employs a cointegration framework in order to investigate the relationship between disaggregate energy consumption and industrial output in Pakistan.

The paper is marked by a number of serious defects:

Firstly, it does not meet general economic standards. The introduction is too short. The research question, its importance and the contribution to the literature remains unclear. Moreover, it does not discuss the relationship to the results of other existing studies and there are various language mistakes. The references, finally, should not contain links to journal websites.

Second, it needs to be better explained why it is reasonable to use CPI as proxy for energy prices. Merely referring to the paper by G. Hondroyiannis et al. (2002) is not sufficient. That paper, moreover, is not included in the references.

Finally, the number of observations in the dataset seems to insufficient for estimating a cointegration model and for performing unit root tests.