REVIEW OF "MEASURING GROUP DISADVANTAGE WITH INTER-DISTRIBUTIONAL INEQUALITY INDICES: A CRITICAL REVIEW AND SOME AMENDMENTS TO EXISTING INDICES"

This paper is a review of the main approaches of inter-distributional inequality indices that checks whether they verify or not the so-called Group-Specific Disadvantage Focus (GDF) property, together with others such as if they exclusively identify distributional equality or first-order stochastic dominance. Given that all these indices violate some of these properties, the author proposes some transformations in order to fulfill them.

The main strength of the paper is to highlight the fact that most approaches to inter-distributional inequality between two groups do not explicitly allow to measure the disadvantage of one group with respect to the other (GDF). This property is motivated based on the analysis of discrimination and equality of opportunity, fields in which this property can be very useful. But the author shows that with little manipulation of the indices they can be adapted to fulfill this and other desirable properties.

The paper would be improved, however, by providing from the beginning a more appealing motivation of all the required properties the author demands, as well as a rigorous definition of all of them, not only of GDF. Additionally, it would be useful to guide the reader about how to choose among the many indices he is proposing, that is, when they should be chosen.

Minor points:
i) Footnote 2 (page 2), there is a question mark in the last line.
ii) There are some extensions of the approach by Butler and McDonald (1987) that should be referred to.
iii) Missing "n" in the "The I turn to an …" (page 4, first sentence, second paragraph).
iv) What is the interpretation of alpha when >1 in equations (3) and (4)?